The Evolution of ‘Us’

Joe Henrich
Department of Human Evolutionary Biology
Harvard University

Global Empowerment Meeting
Center for International Development
17 April 2018
Points of Departure

• Ape—status, mating, inbreeding aversion, fears, mothering, etc.
• Cultural species
• Culture-driven genetic evolution
• Norms arise spontaneously from learning and social interaction
• Norms can be arbitrary
• But, most powerful/stable norms are anchored in genetically evolved psychology
• Institutions = packages of norms
• Psychology adapts to this culturally constructed world
Innate Anchors

• **Kin psychology**—help blood relatives
• **Pair-bonding**—form deep emotional bonds with mates for long enough to raise kids (foundation of marriage)
• **Incest aversion**—avoid sex with primary relatives (parents and sibs)
• **Interdependence psychology**—help those you depend on (‘in the same boat’)
• **Tribal psychology**—preferential interaction and preference for those sharing your ‘ethnic markers’ (dialect, language, dress, etc.)
Evolving kin-based institutions

- Mobile hunter-gatherers had extensive kinship
- Kinship norms intensified after agricultural revolution, as societies scaled up in size and complexity
  - Extensions of primary kin relations with norms governing relationships.
  - Incest taboos on some cousins and preferred marriage to other cousins to bind groups (arranged marriage)
  - Unilineal inheritance—create clans, eliminates COIs
  - Communal ownership of land or corporate responsibility for crimes
- Communal Rituals and Ancestor Gods
- Constructs thicker webs interpersonal relations and creates tribes and ethnic groups (marriage rules)
Key Distinction

• Interpersonal relationships, ascribed in-groups
  – Especially strong when embedded within dense networks. Strong interdependence.
  – In-group loyalty, adherence to tradition, power of elders, etc. Tie individual’s success to group.
  – Prosociality is relationship dependent, contextual, etc.

• Impersonal interactions/exchanges
  – Strangers, anonymous others
  – Other ethnic groups or religions
  – *Principles* not *relationships* or *identity*
  – Based on norms but weakly tethered.

Powered up over much of societal evolution

Two virtues!!

Newer, rooted in a different psychology and set of institutions
First states begin to emerge as *non-relational institutions* develop at the interface between elites and the rest.
Reduced tribal and ethnic boundaries (shared customs)

New kinds of state bureaucracies, organizations

Simple kinship
- Nuclear bilateral families
- Lineal emphasis (cousins out)
- Neolocal residence: economic independence
- No arranged marriages or poly
- No marrying relatives (incest)
- Church provides safety nets

Complex kinship
- Web of ascribed obligations, etc.
- Polygynous, arranged, cousin marriage
- Personal Identity—nodal nexus
- Legal unit, corporate
- Safety net, orphans/elderly; guarantor of security

Psychologically adapted to different institutions

Shared Religious Identity

Western Church Dismantled Complex Kinship
Imposition or adoption of European-derived formal institutions

Formal state institutions: bureaucracies, organizations

Elite Strata (organized by Intensive kinship)

Complex kinship
- Web of ascribed obligations, responsibilities, etc.
- Polygynous, arranged, cousin marriage
- Productive units
- Personal Identity—nodal nexus
- Legal unit, corporate responsibility and ownership
- Safety net, orphans/elderly; guarantor of security

The foundation of nearly all complex societies
Measure kin-based institutions and Church’s Marriage and Family Program

- **Kinship Intensity Index**
  - Ethnographic Atlas aggregates cousin marriage, polygyny, lineages, extended families/residence (V2), community organization (V2).
  - Similar to Enke

- **Cousin marriage data**
  - Actual marriages (Bittles)
  - Kin Linguistic terminology
  - Dispensation requests

- **Duration of the Church MFP (Marriage and Family Program)**
Outgroup: (iv) people s/he meets for the first time, (v) people of another religion, (vi) people of another nationality.

Ingroup: (i) family, (ii) the neighbors, (iii) people known personally,
Outgroup: (iv) people s/he meets for the first time, (v) people of another religion, (vi) people of another nationality.

Ingroup: (i) family, (ii) the neighbors, (iii) people known personally,
Real money on the line

10 rounds, same people. Income maximizers should give nothing

The Public Goods Game

1. All four players can contribute between zero and 20 dollars

2. After all contributions, the pot increases by 40%

3. The pot is then divided equally among all players, regardless of their contributions

Players are anonymous
Real money on the line

Kinship Intensity Index  Cousin Marriage (% logged)  Church Exposure (centuries)
Voluntary, anonymous blood donations

C

Kinship Intensity Index

Cousin Marriage (% logged)

Church Exposure (centuries)
Blood Donations in Italian Provinces

Cousin marriages based on dispensations

Voluntary anonymous blood donations

rho: -.64, P=0
Passenger’s Dilemma: you are riding in car and your friend is driving. He’s driving recklessly and kills a pedestrian. His lawyer tells you that if you testify that he was driving responsibly, under the speed limit, he’ll get off. Otherwise, he’ll do prison time.

Darker shades lie for (i.e., help) their friends (% of people)
Passenger Dilemma

- Kinship Intensity Index vs. Cousin Marriage (% logged)
- Church Exposure (centuries)
Impersonal Honesty

Rolls a die twice
Payments according to roll on
1 = $5; 2 = $10; 3 = $15; 4 = $20
5 = $25; 6 = $0

Non-social rule following
Can take the money for family and friends, or abide by institutional rules

Gächter & Schulz 2016
Impartial Dice Game
United Nation Diplomatic Parking Tickets

Kinship Intensity Index  Cousin Marriage (% logged)  Church Exposure (centuries)
Papal Church Expansion

Map showing bishoprics in 500 AD.
Key points for contemporary debates

• The tension is not about cooperation vs. non-cooperation
• It’s about the smaller scale forms of cooperation, rooted interpersonal relations and tribal thinking, vs.
• Impersonal prosociality and impartial rules
• Instincts as well as historical kin-based institutions shape our psychology even centuries after they’ve dissolved.
• Path to modern formal institutions involved undercutting the tools of small-scale cooperation
  – No arranged marriage, polygyny, cousin marriage, tribes, ecstatic rituals, collective guilt, clans, etc.
  – Unable to form the traditional cooperative units, people joined voluntary associations
  – Intergroup competition among voluntary associations
MFP Dosages
Blood Donations in Italian Provinces

Voluntary anonymous blood donations

Cousin marriages based on dispensations
The Moral Sentiments of “Us”

Jonathan Haidt
NYU—Stern School of Business
GEM, April 17, 2018
Imposition or adoption of European-derived formal institutions

Formal state institutions: bureaucracies, organizations

Elite Strata (organized by Intensive kinship)

Complex kinship
- Web of ascribed obligations, responsibilities, etc.
- Polygynous, arranged, cousin marriage
- Productive units
- Personal Identity—nodal nexus
- Legal unit, corporate responsibility and ownership
- Safety net, orphans/elderly; guarantor of security

The foundation of nearly all complex societies
The Fine Tuned Universe

"The laws of science... contain many fundamental numbers, like the size of the electric charge of the electron and the ratio of the masses of the proton and the electron...

The remarkable fact is that the values of these numbers seem to have been very finely adjusted to make possible the development of life."

--Stephen Hawking
Humans are tribal primates evolved for life in small fission-fusion societies with intense animistic religion and violent intergroup conflict.

We are unsuited for life in large diverse secular societies, unless you get certain settings “finely adjusted to make possible the development of [stable political] life.”

E. O. Wilson
The Fine-Tuned Liberal Democracy

“A common passion or interest will... be felt by a majority of the whole... and there is nothing to check the inducements to sacrifice the weaker party or an obnoxious individual.

Hence it is that such democracies have ever been spectacles of turbulence and contention... and have in general been as short in their lives as they have been violent in their deaths.”

James Madison, Federalist 10
We the People

Article I

Section 1

All legislative Powers herein granted shall be vested in a Congress of the United States, which shall consist of a Senate and House of Representatives.

Section 2

The Congress shall assemble at least once in every year, and such meeting shall begin at the first Monday in December, unless they shall by law appoint a different day.

Section 3

The Congress shall chuse their Speaker, and they may chuse a President of the United States, which choice shall be final, unless the Congress shall die within forty days from the date of such meeting.

Section 4

The Congress shall have the power...
WE’RE OUT!

- After 43 years, UK freed from shackles of EU
- PM in crisis as voters reject Project Fear
- Leave surge sends pound to a 31-year low
DEMOCRATS, STUDENTS AND FOREIGN ALLIES FACE THE REALITY OF A TRUMP PRESIDENCY

Grief and Glee as an Administration Once Unthinkable Takes Shape

BY PATRICK HEALY and JEREMY W. PETERS

The American political establishment reeled on Wednesday as leaders in both parties began coming to grips with four years of President Donald J. Trump in the White House, a once-imagined scenario that has now plunged the United States and its allies and adversaries into a period of deep uncertainty about the policies and impact of his administration.

Democrats, who will be out of power in both the White House and Congress for the first time since 2006, were particularly crestfallen that Hillary Clinton had a slender lead in the popular vote but lost in the Electoral College, a fate similar to Al Gore’s in 2000.

On campuses nationwide, students marched against Mr. Trump with signs bearing slogans like “Not my president,” and protesters in Oakland, Calif., smashed windows and set fire to garbage bins. On Wednesday night, thousands of people protested in several cities, including Chicago, Philadelphia, Seattle and New York, where demonstrators converged in Midtown Manhattan in front of Trump Tower, the home of the president-elect. (Page P3.)

With millions of other voters euphoric at the election of a true political outsider as president, the clash divided over Mr. Trump’s approach to unity from his two biggest opponents, President Obama and Mrs. Clinton. At separate news conferences, they urged Americans to come together for the sake of the republic, and for the good of Mr. Trump’s presidency.

“We are all new residents for his time,” said Mr. Obama, who planned to meet with Mr. Trump at the White House on Thursday. “The peaceful transfer of power is one of the hallmarks of our democracy. And over the next few months, we are going to show that to the world.”

Mrs. Clinton, in her first remarks to supporters after the election, said Americans owed Mr....

Continued on Page 10, Page P3

Having Heard the Talk, World Awaits Action

Populist Fury May Backfire

This article is by DANA B. LANGER, MAGGIE IBARRA and BRIANNA APPELMAN.

It was in Mr. Trump’s last months in office that Mr. Trump took on a lofty goal: to reform the immigration, economic and foreign policy establishment. But that agenda was not the only thing Mr. Trump became known for.

It was in Mr. Trump’s last months in office that Mr. Trump took on a lofty goal: to reform the immigration, economic and foreign policy establishment. But that agenda was not the only thing Mr. Trump became known for.

News Outlets Wonder Where They Stumbled

White Voters In Broad Bloc Shaped Upset

President Obama and Vice President Joseph R. Biden Jr.

Donald J. Trump and his family on election night. He has shown a willingness to entertain two contradictory thoughts at once.
Why is Europe so fed up?
The Global Populist Surge Is More than Just a Western Story—Just Look at Asia

Populism may be surging in the West, but it's a phenomenon across the Asia-Pacific as well.

By Devin T. Stewart and Jeffrey Wasserstrom
December 10, 2016

Italian voters block a referendum backed by the country's Prime Minister. Austrian voters turn back a far-right candidate's efforts to gain power. Surprises come from Germany, with Angela Merkel calling for a partial ban on the burqa, and from Sweden as groups playing to anti-immigration sentiment show they are gearing up to make a play for power in a traditionally liberal country.

Image Credit: Flickr/ Narendra Modi
Italy’s Five Star Movement and the triumph of digital populism

Jamie Bartlett

March 2018
Macron: political divisions in Europe are like a civil war

French president calls for defence of European liberal democracy in face of illiberalism and nationalism
Is it Economics?

Economic change is dividing Britain into winners and losers

Behind the Rise of Populism, Economic Angst
Politicians in Europe and the U.S. adopt extreme views to court an angry and anxious electorate

By Gerald F. Seib
Updated Jan. 20, 2016 2:03 a.m. ET
Ch. 1: The Rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What Now?
Ch. 1: The Rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What Now?
The most important graph in the world

Source: Derek Thompson (2012) based on Angus Maddison data
--Giant values survey, hundreds of questions on values, democracy, gender, religion, globalization, diversity, family…
--Now up to 95 countries
transition from agriculture to industry (materialist values)

transition from industry to service economy (post materialist values)
Survival

Traditional

Secular-Rational

Self-Expression

WVS-6 data from 2012
Prosperity + security $\rightarrow$ Self-expression values
Prosperity + security → Self-expression values

“Fading existential pressures open people’s minds, making them prioritize freedom over security, autonomy over authority, diversity over uniformity, and creativity over discipline.” (Welzel, 2010)

Especially in the young “cosmopolitan” elite: a new moral worldview -- globalism
The Globalist Anthem:

*Imagine there's no countries*
*It isn't hard to do*
*Nothing to kill or die for*
*And no religion too*
*Imagine all the people*
*Living life in peace*

... I hope someday you'll join us
*And the world will be as one*
Welcome to YourMorals.org, where you can learn about your own morals and/or values, while also contributing to scientific research. We are a group of professors and graduate students in social psychology at the University of California (Irvine), and the University of Southern California. (Contact us here.)

Our goal is to understand the way our "moral minds" work. Why do we disagree so passionately about what is right? Why, in particular, is there so much hostility and incomprehension between members of different political parties? By filling out a few of our surveys, you'll help us answer those questions. We will give you an immediate report on how you scored on each study, and we'll show you how your responses compare to others and what people might say about you.
The “Identification with all humanity” scale
(McFarland, 2005)

1) How much would you say you care (feel upset, want to help) when bad things happen to
___ People in my community
___ People in my country
___ People anywhere in the world
The “Identification with all humanity” scale
(McFarland, 2005)

2) How close do you feel to ...

  ____ People in my community
  ____ People in my country
  ____ People anywhere in the world
The “Identification with all humanity” scale
(McFarland, 2005)

3) How often do you use the word “we” to refer to...

___People in my community
___People in my country
___People anywhere in the world
Ch.1: The Rise of the Globalists

A) A set of innovations that first came together in Europe has created prosperous (and eventually peaceful) societies.

B) Peace and prosperity change values, minds, cultures... creates a new kind of person: a globalist, cosmopolitan, “anywhere.”
Ch. 1: The Rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What Now?
Ch. 1: The Rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What Now?
Joseph’s Families Journey to Goshen Due to the Famine

Fertile Nile Delta

Canaan

Egypt

Genesis 47
Foreign-Born Population and Percentage of Total Population, for the United States: 1850 to 2010

These Days, All Eyes are on Europe

European migration routes
Irregular migrant maritime arrivals
Jan-Aug 2015, '000

Source: International Organisation for Migration
*Includes maritime and land arrivals
حتى تضع الحرب أوزارها، فينزل عيسى عليه السلام
Germany opens its gates: Berlin says all Syrian asylum-seekers are welcome to remain, as Britain is urged to make a 'similar statement'

Berlin suspends 1990 protocol – a decision that will increase pressure on Britain and other EU countries to follow suit

Allan Hall in Berlin, John Lichfield | Monday 24 August 2015 | 0 comments
Monthly asylum applications to Europe

October 2015: 185,340

To:
- Europe
- of which, Germany
Volunteers Helping Refugees In Greece Fear Government Clampdown

The government is rolling out a registration drive amid the arrests of five international volunteers.
Globalists are universalists; dislike patriotism

"Internationalism... tells us we should [before] someone living in Kinshasa is of no less worth than someone living in Kensington. Patriotism, if it means anything, tells us we should favour the interests of British people before this.

--George Monbiot
But nationalists are patriotic, and hate the anti-patriotism of the globalists.
Frequent conflicts over whether host country should adapt, or immigrants should assimilate
Sweden stirs debate with women-only swimming, in nod to Muslims

MODELS OF THOUGHT

As Muslims become a larger part of Swedish society, some municipal pools are offering women-only swimming to accommodate the new arrivals. But while well intended, the new policy is bumping up against Swedish ideals of equality.

By Elisabeth Braw, Correspondent | MAY 30, 2016
Poll: Majority of Americans Don’t Want to Press 1 for English
Please, tell me more about how you came to our country and now want us to change our traditions because they offend you.
Ch.2: Immigration

A) Wealth, stability, opportunity, and cosmopolitan values attracts mass immigration...

B) which rouses concerns of the Nationalists, triggers “culture wars” over burkas, Christmas, food, language, crime...
Ch. 1: The Rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What Now?
Ch. 1: The Rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What Now?
Authoritarian triad: Moral, political, and racial intolerance go together.

But not a stable trait; It’s a psychological predisposition, found in 20-30% of the population, activated by “normative threat...”
Main normative threats:

1) disobedience to group authorities or authorities unworthy of respect

2) nonconformity to group norms

3) lack of consensus in group values and beliefs; diversity ‘run amok’
“The crime and violence that today afflicts our nation will soon come to an end. Beginning on January 20, 2017, safety will be restored.”
Sweden's backlash: Why the tide is turning for refugees

We speak to Swedish politicians and citizens to find out what is behind the current backlash against immigration.

09 Apr 2016 14:55 GMT | Refugees, Sweden, Politics, Asylum Seekers, Europe
Ch.3: The Authoritarian Alarm

A) All populations contain multiple personality types, incl. “authoritarian predisposition”

B) “Normative threat” pushes a button in authoritarian minds, activates strong intolerance and support for a strongman who will restore unity, similarity.

C) This is not selfish; it is “groupish,” a tribal sentiment
Ch. 1: The rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What now?
Ch. 1: The rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What now?
“We can best limit intolerance of difference by parading, talking about, and applauding our sameness... Ultimately, nothing inspires greater tolerance from the intolerant than an abundance of common and unifying beliefs, practices, rituals, institutions, and processes.”
“And regrettably, nothing is more certain to provoke increased expression of their latent predispositions than the likes of ‘multicultural education,’ bilingual policies, and non-assimilation.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Centrifugal (outward)</th>
<th>Centripetal (inward)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vast size</td>
<td>Small</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linguistic diversity</td>
<td>Shared language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short history</td>
<td>Long history, deep roots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural or religious diversity</td>
<td>Shared cultural norms/values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High levels of immigration, esp.</td>
<td>Low immigration, OR immigr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from diff regions on WVS map</td>
<td>from same region of WVS map</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict within nation</td>
<td>Conflict with other nation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tusk blames 'utopian' EU elites for Eurosceptic revolt and Brexit crisis

“It is us who today are responsible… Obsessed with the idea of instant and total integration, we failed to notice that ordinary people, the citizens of Europe, do not share our Euro-enthusiasm.”

Donald Tusk, the EU’s first Eastern European president, has accused Brussels of trampling on the historic nation states
What now?

1) Globalists must understand concerns of their nationalist compatriots

2) Patriotism is not the same as racism; encourage healthy forms, unifying identities. (Or you might get racial identity politics)

3) Mass immigration has mixed effects (good for economy & innovation; bad for social cohesion and trust); consider high-skill immigration with assimilation.
Ch. 1: The Rise of the Globalists

Ch. 2: Immigration

Ch. 3: The Authoritarian Alarm

Ch. 4: What Now?
Humans are tribal primates evolved for life in small fission-fusion societies with intense animistic religion and violent intergroup conflict. We are unsuited for life in large diverse secular societies, unless you get certain settings “finely adjusted to make possible the development of stable political life.”
The Moral Sentiments of “Us”

Jonathan Haidt
NYU—Stern School of Business
GEM, April 17, 2018